

EASTERN AND SOUTHERN AFRICA HIGHER EDUCATION CENTERS OF EXCELLENCE (ACE II) PROJECT

AFRICAN CENTER OF EXCELLENCE IN ENERGY FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ACE-ESD)

SEMI-ANNUAL INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT FOR THE PERIOD FROM 01 JULY TO 31 DECEMBER 2022

April 2023

Table of Contents

1.		INTRODUCTION	2
	1.1.	Project background	2
	1.2.	Project information	2
	1.3.	Project overview	3
	1.4.	Funding summary	4
	1.5.	Structure	4
	1.6.	Responsibilities of Management	4
	1.7.	Responsibilities of the Internal Auditors	5
	1.8.	Audit objectives	5
	1.9.	Scope and Methodology of the audit	5
2.		EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	7

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Project background

The African Centers of Excellence (ACEs) financed under the ACE II Project supports the Governments of **eight** (8) participating countries (namely Ethiopia, Kenya, Malawi, Mozambique, Rwanda, Tanzania, Uganda, and Zambia) to collectively address keydevelopment challenges facing the Eastern and Southern Africa region through interventions in developing critically-needed science and technology capacity. Accordingly, the International Development Association availed to Rwanda a credit amounting to **SDR 14,500,000** (Special Drawing Right) equivalent to **USD 20,000,000** to strengthen selected Higher Education Institutions.

They are competitive loans won by the University of Rwanda, College of Science and Technology (CST), College of Education (CE), and College of Business and Economics respectively, on behalf of the Government of Rwanda to overcome the identified gaps in handling big data, bioinformatics, data mining, reliability modeming, research design, and evidence-based policy analysis through delivering postgraduate studies, organizing professional courses and promoting collaborative research in the Eastern on and Southern Africa.

The main objective of this project is to establish and strengthen Specialization and collaboration among a network of higher education institutions in the Eastern and Southern Africa region, to deliver quality post-graduate education, and build corroborative research capacity in the regional priority area to address key development challenges facing the region.

1.2. Project information

Project start date:	The project approval date is 26 May 2016						
	The project signature of agreement date is 17 June 2016						
	The project effectiveness date is 17 October 2016						
Project end date:	The project's expected completion date is 31 December 2023						
Project Manager	Dr. Charles KABIRI						
Project budget by Lender	World Bank: USD 5.5 Million						
The total cost of the project	USD 5.5 million						
Implementing Budget	University of Rwanda						
Agency							

UNIVERSITY OF RWANDA-AFRICAN CENTER OF EXCELLENCE - ENERGY FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ACE-ESD) $\,$

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT FOR THE PERIOD OF 6 MONTHS FROM 01 JULY TO 31 DECEMBER 2022

1.3. Project overview

Line Agency of	University of Rwanda								
the project	Chiversity of Kwanua								
Strategic goals/	The objective of this project is to result in building the capacity of the								
objectives of the									
project	College of Science and Technology to undertake interdisciplinary								
project	research and training in smart and micro-grid energy technologies								
	tailored to serve remote and/or rural areas using renewable sources,								
	power systems, and energy management and trade policy, train 40 Ph.D.								
	and 120 MSc Energy experts and improve research and teaching								
Main aamnananta	The main commonant of the project is to greate a world class energy center.								
Main components	The main component of the project is to create a world-class energy center								
of the project	that will be a regional hub for research and training of African engineers,								
	policymakers, and energy utility managers (in micro-grid energy systems								
	using renewable energy sources and interstate energy trading,								
	management, and policy); contribute to rural development through								
	technology transfer, and nurture and promote entrepreneurship								
0-44-	development in the energy sector towards sustainable development.								
Outputs of the	1. To provide national and regional capacity-building (MSc & Ph.D.)								
projects	for the establishment and implementation of energy systems using								
	local energy sources and appropriate technologies to cover energy								
	needs for sustainable development.								
	2. To develop and transfer appropriate energy technologies for								
	sustainabledevelopment at the national and regional levels;								
	3. To contribute and strengthen cooperation between industry and								
	academia in the field of clean energy.								
	4. To provide energy research, consultancy, and advisory services to								
	both public and private organizations at national, regional, and								
	international levels;								
	5. To provide policy development skills training for students, policy-								
	makers and								
	6. Utility managers aimed at building policy and monitoring capacity in								
	the region which is critical for effective interconnection of energy								
	systems.								
Programs offered	1. Ph.D. by Research Programs in Electrical Power Systems, Energy								
by the African	Economics, and Renewable Energy								
Center of									
Excellence in	2. Masters of Science Programs in Electrical Power Systems, Energy								
Energy for	Economics, and Renewable Energy								
Sustainable									
Development	3. Short courses in different energy-related disciplines								

1.4. Funding summary

31 DECEMBER 2022

The University of Rwanda, Centres of Excellence are financed through credit Agreement no 5796- RW signed on 17 June 2016 between the Government of Rwanda and the International Development Association. The credit is valued at USD 20 million for a period starting from 30 September 2016 to 31 December 2023, where funds allocated to ACE-ESD are worth USD 5.5 million with an implementation period of 5 years as highlighted in the table below:

Source of funds	Committed amount USD	The cumulative amount received to 30 June 2022 USD	Undrawn balance to 30 June 2022 USD
	(A)	(B)	C=(A)-(B)
World Bank	5,500,000	4,643,001	856,999
Total	5,500,000	4,643,001	856,999

Their funding model is performance-based whereby plans and achievements must be guided by the set indicators to lead to funds disbursement (Disbursement Linked Indicators and Disbursement Linked results).

1.5. Structure

The daily activities of the University of Rwanda, African Centre of Excellence in Energy for Sustainable Development academic programs are coordinated by Director while the University of Rwanda, Deputy-Vice-Chancellor for Finance and SPIU Coordinator, coordinates the Finance and administrative services of the Center.

1.6. Responsibilities of Management

Article 19 of Organic Law N° 12/2013/OL OF 12/09/2013 on State Finances and Property attributes the following responsibilities to the Chief Budget Manager:

- To manage effectively, efficiently, and in a transparent manner all the public funds for the a public entity under his/her responsibility by relevant legal provisions;
- To establish and maintain effective, efficient, and transparent systems of internal controls and risk management;
- To maintain accounts and records of the public entity under his/her responsibility by the financial regulations prescribed by the Minister;
- To supervise and ensure proper use of public funds at the disposal of subsidiary entities under his/her responsibility

- To exercise control over the execution of the budget of the public entity under his/her responsibility, in compliance with all provisions of this Organic Law as well as regulations issued by the Minister
- To ensure compliance with all the provisions of this Organic Law, regulations issued by the Minister, and other laws relating to public finance.

1.7. Responsibilities of the Internal Auditors

Article 10 of Ministerial Order N° 003/17/10/TC Of 27/10/2017 setting out Regulations for Internal Audit and Audit Committees in Public Entities requires the internal auditor to perform the following:

- To evaluate the adequacy and effectiveness of controls of governance, operations, and information systems;
- To assure management and the Audit Committee on the adequacy and effectiveness of the risk management process,
- To provide appropriate recommendations for improving the governance process in the accomplishment of its objectives;
- To make recommendations to avoid waste and fraud and investigate the suspected fraud or irregularity;
- To provide consulting services through training, support implementation of accounting systems, internal control documentation, risk management facilitation, and other similar services on the request of management, Audit Committee, or other high-level authorities;
- To communicate opportunities for improving management control, viability, and sustainability of services or profitability identified during the audit to the appropriate level of management

1.8. Audit objectives

The main objective of this internal audit assignment was to check whether the University of Rwanda - ACEESD has put in place an effective internal control system to ensure the project achieves its objectives.

The general objective of the review was to evaluate the adequacy and effectiveness of the existing risk management controls, and governance processes in place to provide an independent opinion on whether these processes are functioning as intended and the ACEESD objectives are being met.

Further, the audit was aimed at making recommendations to address any weaknesses that may be identified during the audit.

1.9. Scope and Methodology of the audit

1.9.1. Scope of the Audit

The internal audit was conducted for 6 months from 01 July to 31 December 2022. The audit was also to review the ACE - ESD revenue and expenditure to check whether the related controls in place were effective enough to confirm their completeness and occurrence as reported in the Interim Financial Report (IFR).

1.9.2. Audit methodology

During the audit of the project, the following methodology was used:

- Discussion with key project staff
- Understanding the processes
- Review of different project documents and records to better understand the project activities
- Designed and performed audit procedures to obtain sufficient and appropriate evidence to provide reasonable assurance that the project resources are properly managed.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our independent opinion.

> Financial Audit

The following audit methodology was applied while auditing financial transactions included in the project books of account:

- Assessment of risks through understanding financial processes and procedures,
- Design and perform audit procedures to obtain sufficient and appropriate audit evidence to assure whether the project financial report was properly prepared and supported,
- Performing audit procedures to confirm whether existing controls were adequately and effectively implemented.

> Compliance Audit

The following audit methodology was applied while auditing compliance with laws and regulations relating to public spending:

- Assessment of risks of non-compliance with laws and regulations in force as well as the terms and conditions included in the financing agreement which may prevent the project to achieve the intended objective in due time,
- Design and perform compliance audit procedures to confirm whether the ACE-ESD activities were implemented by different project documents and existing laws and regulations as well.

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT FOR THE PERIOD OF 6 MONTHS FROM 01 JULY TO 31 DECEMBER 2022

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Basis of our independent audit observation

We conducted an independent evaluation of the internal control system at UR-ACESD by the internal audit standards issued by the Government of Rwanda and in compliance with the requirements of the Ministerial Order N° 003/17/10/TC of 27/10/2017. The Order sets out regulations for internal audit and audit committees in public entities. By those regulations, the evaluation entailed the assessment of the design and implementation of the different elements of the internal control system at UR-ACE ESD notably; its control environment, risk assessment, control activities, information and communication, and internal control monitoring.

Our audit approach was risk-based and as such our tests were tailored according to ACEs risk analysis. The management of UR-ACE ESD provided us with the information we deemed necessary for the audit, and we believe that we obtained sufficient evidence to support our independent opinion.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of our evaluation, in our opinion, the internal control system at the University of Rwanda -ACE ESD was adequate and effectively implemented throughout the period.

.....

MIEZERO MUNYAMPUNDU Janvier

ACEs Internal Auditor Specialist

Date: April 2023

DETAILED FINDINGS

1. Underpayment of students' stipends due to the use of the wrong exchange rate.

Observation

The review of the monthly stipends paid to sponsored students under ACE ESD noted that they were underpaid by Frw 1,748,813.96 due to the use wrong exchange rate. The further review noted that the exchange rate used was 1 USD/Frw 977.505857 as of 02/07/2021 instead of 1 USD/Frw1014.478668 as of 06/07/2022. For more details, refer to Appendix 1:

Risk

The underpayment of stipends may affect the living of students which may ultimately disrupt their study plan hence delay of the center to achieve the objectives as far as the students' completion is concerned.

Recommendation

- The center management should ensure that the underpaid amount is regularized to the students by paying the unpaid amount.
- The center management should ensure that the appropriate amount is paid to students to avoid any adverse effect on students and center objectives.

Management comments

The observation was noted, the above underpayment will be investigated and those underpayments will be regularized.

2. Weaknesses noted in the declaration of tax and statutory deductions

Observation

A review of expenditures and tax declaration of ACE-ESD for the semi-annual period ended 30 June 2023 revealed the following irregularities:

Failure to declare both value-added tax 18% and withholding tax 3%.

Article 10 of law N°38/2012 of 20/12/2012 modifying and complementing the law n°25/2005 of 04/12/2005 on tax procedures as modified and complemented to date stipulates that a public institution, which awarded the tender, withhold the Value Added Tax on public tenders. A public institution that awarded the tender has the responsibility to file a tax declaration in accordance with the form prescribed by the Commissioner General of Rwanda Revenue Authority and pay the tax withheld within fifteen (15) days following the end of the month in which the winner of the public tender has submitted the invoice (and not when the winner of the public tender is paid). The public institution which fails to withhold the Value Added Tax or withheld Value Added Tax and failed to pay the tax withheld to the Tax Administration must pay the Tax not withheld or not paid, fines, and interests as provided for by this law.

In addition, article 62 of law n ° 016/2018 of 13/04/2018, establishing taxes on income states that a withholding tax on public tenders of three percent (3%) of the sum of invoice, excluding the Value Added Tax (VAT), is retained when public tenders are paid and the article 63 states that the person who withholds taxes referred to in articles 59, 60 and 62 of this law is required to file a tax declaration and make payment in accordance with the procedures prescribed by the Tax Administration within a period of fifteen (15) days after the month in which the taxes were withheld.

Contrary to the above requirements, the review of taxes annexures provided noted that ACE-ESD management did not declare value added tax of **Frw 568,878.71** and 3% withholding tax of **Frw 94,813.12**, retained on paid invoices by UR ACE-ESD project during the year under review. *Se detailed in table below:*

N o	Description	Supplier	Pa ym ent dat e	In voi ce dat e	Rec epti on dat e	SDC Number	In voi ce nu m be r	Amou nt includ ing VAT	VAT not decla red (18%	Withh olding (3%)	
	Payment for		28-	03-	03-	SDC00702	02	1,783,	272.1	45.25	
	electronic door locker	D ' 1	09-	06-	06-	0247/805/8	83	776.0	272,1	45,35	
1	and headphones cat3	Preview solution	22	22	22	05 NS	2	0	01.42	0.24	
		RWANDA	28-	14-	26-		14				
		TOURISM AND	09-	09-	09-	SDC00700	96	739,5	112,8	18,80	
2	Car hire	TRAVEL	22	22	22	4039/14940	8	40.00	11.19	1.86	

		AGENCY								
			26-	27-	27-	SDC00700				
	Payment of catering	UBUZIMA	09-	07-	07-	1347/4513/	46	342,0	52,16	8,694.
3	services	Restaurant	22	22	22	4513 NS	87	00.00	9.49	92
			26-	20-	20-	SDC00700				
	Payment of catering	UBUZIMA	09-	07-	07-	1347/4506/	46	114,0	17,38	2,898.
4	services	Restaurant	22	22	22	4506 NS	80	00.00	9.83	31
			28-	10-	10-	SDC00702				
			09-	08-	08-	8029/3005/	30	750,0	114,4	19,06
5	Hotel services	Nobleza hotel	22	22	22	3005 NS	68	00.00	06.78	7.80
								3,729,		
								316.0	568,8	94,81
		Total						0	78.71	3.12

> Failure to declare retained and paid statutory deductions on employment income

Article 57 point one of law n ° 016/2018 of 13/04/2018 states that an individual or an entity that pays its employees in cash or in kind are responsible for withholding and paying the withholding tax on employment income referred to in Article 15 of this Law. Employers referred to in Paragraph One of this Article paying the withholding tax on employment income must, within fifteen (15) days following the end of each month or quarter depending on the relevant laws file a tax declaration through procedures specified by the Tax Administration and transmit the tax withheld.

Contrary to the above article, the review of the payment made by ACE ESD noted the payment made to different supervisors who are not Rwanda residents, however, their withholding of 15% taxes were not declared to the competent authority. **See details in the following table:**

	NAMES	Date of payment	Amount	Withholding tax (15%)
1	SEBITOSI Adonia Benaya	15-12-22	629,412	94,411.80
2	Joseph Mutale	15-12-22	314,706	47,205.90
3	Christopher Senfuka	15-12-22	314,706	47,205.90
4	Johan Meyer	15-12-22	629,412	94,411.80
5	Diego Sandoval	15-12-22	1,049,020	157,353.00
6	Wand Yanmin	15-12-22	1,049,020	157,353.00
7	Jonathan Colton	15-12-22	1,049,020	157,353.00
8	Pitshou N Bokoro	15-12-22	314,706	47,205.90
9	Cuthbert Nyamupangedengu	15-12-22	314,706	47,205.90
10	Johan Meyer	15-12-22	314,706	47,205.90
11	Ijumba Nelson	15-12-22	1,101,471	165,220.65
12	Burnet Mkandawire	15-12-22	1,049,020	157,353.00
13	Mulugeta GebreHiwot GebreMichael	28-07-22	186,977	28,046.62

14	Gatachew Biru Worku	28-07-22	233,722	35,058.28
15	AL-Mars Sendegeya	15-03-22	503,458	75,518.65
16	Michel Roddy LOLLCHUND	15-03-22	503,458	75,518.65
	Total		9,557,520	1,433,628

Risk

Failure to declare statutory deductions retained and paid on suppliers' invoices and employment income paid impose the center to be penalized by tax authority hence the risk of paying wasteful expenditure.

Recommendation

The center management should investigate all taxes that were not declared and make their declarations to avoid the penalties which may be charged to the project.

Management comment

The observation was noted and the investigation will be made and all taxes will be declared.

UNIVERSITY OF RWANDA-AFRICAN CENTER OF EXCELLENCE - ENERGY FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ACE-ESD)

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT FOR THE PERIOD OF 6 MONTHS FROM 01 JULY TO 31 DECEMBER 2022

Appendix 1: Underpayment of students' stipends due to the use of the wrong exchange rate.

Cohort and Name		National ity	Ge nde r		Month					The exchange rate that should have been used	Exchange rate used	Differen ce	Underpay ment
No	Name			Jul- 22	Au g- 22	Sep -22	Oct -22	No v- 22	Total				
	PH.D./COHORT 1			A	В	C	D	E	F=A+B	+C+D+E			
1	Chambile Enock Lumuliko	Tanzania	M	500	500	500			1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
2	Aban Arop yor Ayik	S.sudan	F	550	550	550			1650	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	61,005.14
3	Adeyeye Kehinde Adeseye	Nigeria	F		550	550			1100	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	40,670.09
4	Mburamatare Daniel	Rwanda	M	400	400	400			1200	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	44,367.37
5	Ndizihiwe Prosper	Rwanda	M	400	400	400			1200	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	44,367.37
6	Sekanabo Desire	Rwanda	M	400	400	400			1200	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	44,367.37
7	Muyizere Darius	Rwanda	M	400	400	400			1200	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	44,367.37
	S/Total			2,65 0	3,2 00	3,2 00	-	-	9,050				334,603.9 4
PH.I	D./COHORT 2												
1	GATOTO PLACIDE	Burundi	M	500	500	500			1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
2	CARTLAND RICHARD	Uganda	M	500	500	500			1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
	S/Total			1,00 0	1,0 00	1,0 00	-	-	3,000				110,918.4 3
Mast	ters/COHORT 3												
1	Ange Christian nishimwe NIYONKURU	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
2	Uwitonze Adeline	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
3	MUKAMANA Valentine	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
4	Abiyese Martine	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
5	Gatesi Annuarita	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
6	Nyirantegeyimana Dative	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22

$\hbox{ UNIVERSITY OF RWANDA-AFRICAN CENTER OF EXCELLENCE - ENERGY FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ACE-ESD) } \\$

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT FOR THE PERIOD OF 6 MONTHS FROM 01 JULY TO 31 DECEMBER 2022

	Total												1,748,813. 96
	S/Total			7,05 0	7,0 50	7,0 50	7,0 50	7,0 50	35,25 0				1,303,291. 59
25	SHOAGA Grace Oluwaseun	Nigeria	F	350	350	350	350	350	1750	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	64,702.42
24	CHOMBA Musenge	Zambia	M	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
23	Mwanzia Urbanus	Kenya	M	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
22	Baguma Tumaini	DRC	M	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
21	ADEM Geofrey Ouma	Kenya	M	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
20	Niringiyimana Egide	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
19	Ndayisabye Emmanuel	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
18	Nkundibiza Augustin	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
17	Mbonigaba Innocent	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
16	Hirwa Aime Patrick	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
15	Irakoze shadrack	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
14	Nahimana Enias	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
13	Irutabyose Jean Paul	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
12	Kwizera Jacques	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
11	Hagenimana Jean Claude	Rwanda	M	250	250	250	250	250	1250	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	46,216.01
10	Uwizeyimana Josephine	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
9	Cyize Confidence	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
8	Mugirwanake Marie Louise	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22
7	Nyirazamani slyvia	Rwanda	F	300	300	300	300	300	1500	1014.478668	977.505857	36.97281	55,459.22