

## **DRAFT AIDE MEMOIRE**

### **Eastern and Southern Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence Project (P151847)**

#### **(a) Joint ACE I & ACE II Project Workshop**

#### **(b) ACE II Regional Steering Committee Meeting**

**November 7-10, 2017**

## **1. INTRODUCTION AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

From November 7-10, 2017, a team comprising of Andreas Blom (Lead Economist and Task Team Leader, ACE I), Xiaoyan Liang (Lead Education Specialist and Task Team Leader, ACE II), Himdat Bayusuf (Education Specialist and co-Task Team Leader, ACE I), Lourdes Consuelo Linares Loza (Senior Financial Management Specialist), Celia A Dos Santos Faias (Program Assistant), Nobuyuki Tanaka (Economist), Eunice Yaa Brimfah Ackwerh (Senior Education Specialist), Ekua Nuama Bentil (Education Specialist), Graham Mark Harrison (Senior Science and Technology Specialist), Maud Kouadio-IV (Consultant), Maulshree Gangwar (Consultant), Aissatou Diallo (Financial Management Specialist), Robert Degraft Hanson (Senior Financial Management Specialist), Michel De Marigny (Financial Analyst), Issa Thiam (Finance Officer), Mouhamadou Moustapha Lo (Education Specialist and M&E focal point), Adama Ouedraogo (Senior Education Specialist), Hyacinthe Gbaye (Senior Education Specialist), Hamoud Abdel Wedoud Kamil (Senior Education Specialist), Aisha Garba Mohammed (Education Specialist), Charles Aryee Ashong (Senior Procurement Specialist), Ruth Karimi Charo (Senior Education Specialist), Innocent Mulindwa (Education Specialist), Ana Ruth Menezes (Senior Education Specialist) and Biruk Tekle (Consultant) visited Ghana to (a) facilitate the joint ACE I and ACE II project workshop and (b) participate in the ACEII 8<sup>th</sup> Regional Steering Committee meeting.

Ms. Kathleen C. Beegle, Program Leader from the country office spoke on behalf of the Country Director.

The team would like to extend its thanks to Ghana's National Council on Tertiary Education (NCTE), the Association of African Universities (AAU) for hosting the workshop. The team also expresses its sincere appreciation to IUCEA, ACE II Center leaders and project staff, host university vice chancellors, and members of the ACE II national and regional steering committee members, and partner institutions for their commitment to ACEs.

## **2. ACE I & ACE II JOINT WORKSHOP (NOVEMBER 7-9, 2017)**

The Eastern and Southern Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence Project (ACE II) supports the governments of eight participating countries- Ethiopia, Kenya, Malawi, Mozambique, Rwanda, Tanzania, Uganda, and Zambia in strengthening the selected ACEs to deliver quality post-graduate education and build collaborative research capacity in the regional priority areas. As of October 26, 2017, all 8 countries are now effective, and that 22 out of 24 centers have received the first disbursement for DLI 1 already. Total disbursement to IUCEA and ACEs reached about 18%.

The ACE II team held its 3<sup>rd</sup> Project Workshop jointly with ACE I in Accra, Ghana from November 7<sup>th</sup> to 9<sup>th</sup> (see agenda in Annex B). The workshop brought together 22 ACEs from West and Central Africa (Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Senegal, Nigeria, Ghana, Cote d'Ivoire) and 24 from East and Southern Africa to jointly assess the progress of the project, discuss challenges and share best practices. Many ACEs were accompanied by the VCs of the host institutions. Regional Steering Committee members and IUCEA staff

participated in the workshop. Selected technical experts and collaborating partner institutions also joined in the workshop.

The activities of the joint workshop were spread over three days, which included plenary sessions, working groups by thematic areas, and helpdesks to provide World Bank financial management, disbursement, monitoring and evaluation support. Selected centers also participated in a general performance review with the World Bank task team. The workshop started with a ACE I and ACE II teams providing updates on the progress of the project thus far. There were sessions on international accreditation and quality assurance, verification and M&E, financial management, graduate tracer studies and benchmarking, and university industry linkage. During the parallel working groups, the ACE I and ACE II centers were divided across thematic areas (STEM, including Education & Statistics; Agriculture; and Industry) and were able to discuss their specific strengths and challenges in order to foster cross learning and collaboration among the centers.

### **Key Issues and Messages**

Overall the joint meeting provided an excellent platform to encourage peer sharing and learning. In particular the ACEs are still new in the project implementation and were very eager to hear from the ACEI experiences in addressing key political, technical and operational challenges. Because each one of the 46 ACEs has a particular niche area of research, the joint forum connected the ACEs in similar fields effectively. Some ACEs start providing services to the others.

Further, the joint meeting is an efficient platform for the WB task team and specialists to share with all implementing agencies the Bank operational policies for ACE and to address common implementation challenges. The FM, disbursement, and M&E support clarified some confusion arising from the IPF with DLI design of the project.

All ACEs are struggling to define “excellence” based on their particular context. International accreditation, research publication, and external income generation are key concerns. The WB joint task teams emphasized the importance of quality and excellence as vision for the ACEs. Sustainability of the ACEs, politically, institutionally, and financially is preoccupation. WB teams advised that ACEs should all have their own vision and plan for going forward but leadership and guidance from the senior management of the host university is critical to help define sustainability.

**Monitoring & Evaluation.** The team organized M&E helpdesk to provide quick support for clarification of the definitions, reporting mechanism, and other M&E related matters. While every center presented its own unique accomplishments and challenges, some common themes that required clarifications emerged through the discussions: (i) definitions of indicators in Results Framework and DLI matrix, including external revenue generation, procurement and FM related definition; (ii) periods to be covered by different reports such as Annual Work Plan and procurement audit report; (iii) papers and conference proceedings eligible for counting towards publications; (iv) scope of MoUs and Partnership Agreements; (v) development of a beneficiary satisfaction survey; and (vi) protocol of verification of DLIs.

DLI compliance: In terms of publications it was clarified that to be counted towards DLI the the following need to be observed: (i) only publications that are well aligned with the center’s objectives and programs can be counted towards DLI; (ii) ACE faculty and staff need to at least co-author the publication in a reputable and relevant academic journal. On external revenue generation, it can only be accounted if

received in 'cash'. A more detailed annotated DLI definition is included in the Annex. When the independent verifier is recruited, some tweaking of DLI definitions will still be needed.

The team also took this opportunity to walk the ACEs through an M&E tracking tool template that is being developed to provide the ACEs with an efficient data reporting mechanism (see annex D for M&E tracking tool). Additionally, the team reminded the ACEs to look at the project documents (PAD, POM) and financing agreements and recommended that each ACE have a dedicated M&E officer (M&E function can be multi tasked by another ACE project staff and if so needs to be included in that person's job description) to facilitate smooth reporting of results framework. To help standardize project progress report (in word and in PPT), the WB team will develop standard templates and send to IUCEA and ACEs by the end of November 2017.

The ACEs were also informed that the hiring of an M&E officer for IUCEA is currently underway and should be done before the end of this year. The IUCEA M&E officer will be in charge of consolidating the M&E reports from all ACEs, supporting the ACEs in all M&E functions, and to produce reporting to the World Bank as required.

**Financial Management & Disbursement.** The team organized a Financial Management and Disbursement helpdesk to provide support on FM and disbursement related issues. The team took this opportunity to highlight the importance of timely coordination of the different actors involved in the implementation, including, ACEs' technical and fiduciary teams, hosting university's managerial, administrative and finance teams, as well as IU-CEA, independent verifier and WB. Some of the common themes that emerged from the discussions were related to (i) use of DLIs/DLRs and EEPs; (ii) clarifications on financial reporting and audit requirements; (iii) actions needed to complete FM related DLIs; (iv) need of FM staff to support implementation; (v) clarification on disbursement requirements under the project.

Building on the result-based model, the team explained the definition of EEPs, highlighting that as discussed during project preparation, EEPs should be primarily (and preferably) covered with university's salaries. If for any reason, the spending in salaries were not sufficient to cover (document) the disbursements expected to be made to the ACE, some other non-procurable operating cost would be identified making sure that related budget codes are explicitly identified. The Finance Officer provided explanation on the disbursement requirements, clarifying their mechanism, content and format as follows: i) Statement of EEPs to report the eligible expenditures (as defined before, e.g. salaries) paid by the university, ii) the DLIs verification certificate from the independent verifier and iii) confirmation from country director and/or task team leader that the Association have received the evidences of the DLIs fulfillment and they are satisfactory, which are to be used to support the withdrawal of funds (reimbursement of DLI). The FM specialist agreed that during the next FM session, the Bank team together with hosting university/ ACEs will review and/or reconfirm the availability of sufficient EEPs to document disbursements envisioned under each ACE. FM specialist encouraged the ACE teams to start discussion with the hosting universities on the tasks needed for the achievement of the FM related DLIs after June, 2018.

## **Environmental Safeguards<sup>1</sup>**

---

<sup>1</sup> this section was supplied by Christine Kasedde during the Uganda ACEII visit November 13-16, 2017

Whereas the Environmental risks associated with ACE- II project activities are considered moderate, likely impacts are localized, temporary and can be mitigated, each respective center of excellence is urged to refer to the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) prepared for the project. Each institution should ensure that there is a designated person for the implementation of ESMP, attention should be paid to health and safety, and all categories of wastes generated and these amongst others should be well documented and reported on regularly. Where there is civil works, Environmental, Social, Health and Safety (ESHS) provisions should be integrated into the bidding and contractual documents, the Bank safeguard team will provide needed guidance.

### **Performance Review and Support Discussions.**

A total of 18 ACEs from Kenya, Malawi, Mozambique, Ethiopia, Zambia, Rwanda, and Tanzania participated in the Performance Review and Support Discussions with the TTL and IUCEA member. The conversations were driven towards support that the team could provide to help individual ACEs overcome the challenges they are facing in overall project implementation. While every ACE presented their unique challenges (see appendix A for notes from helpdesks), there were some areas that came up frequently, like (i) increasing enrollment of female and regional students; (ii) engaging with private partners in meaningful and productive ways; (iii) international and regional accreditation of new programs, since accreditation agencies in some programs do not exist and for those that exist the process can be time consuming and expensive; (iv) facilitating cross-continent university partnerships and exchange, as inviting professors from Western universities can be very expensive; (v) procurement of goods under university procurement that follows centralized government procedure can often be very lengthy process; (vi) lack of tangible assistance from national steering committee; (vii) clarification on definitions of short-term courses, as some ACEs understood the duration of the short-term courses was two weeks; and (viii) need for regular virtual meetings with the ACEs to track progress and address emerging issues in a timely manner.

Many of these questions were answered through dialogue among ACEs in a cross-collaboration, as well as by the WB team. In terms of accreditation, the TTL suggested to use the services of IUCEA to facilitate regional accreditation on top of learning from the experiences of ACE I universities who managed to secure regional/international accreditation. Additionally, the team suggested that the ACEs should also directly engage with the accreditation agencies, instead of solely relying on MoE (for Kenya). To minimize the cost of professional fees for professors coming from international universities, the team advised to strengthen South-South cooperation with universities in China, Korea and India. The team assured to follow up with the concerned authorities on national steering committees to ensure that they continue providing support to ACEs as and when required.

In addition to providing feedback on issues faced by ACEs, the TTL stressed that the ACEs should work on a staff development plans especially for training new staff. Additionally, the centers were encouraged to begin planning for tracer studies, including development of design and tools. In terms of MoUs for engagement with the industry, the ACEs should also explore internships for students and short-term hire to enhance employability for the graduates.

### **Benchmarking and Graduate Tracer Study**

The Benchmarking Initiative is under PASET and engages with several experts in developing the methodologies for tools useful for benchmarking, student satisfaction surveys and graduate tracer studies. For example, the benchmarking tool was developed with experts from the internationally

recognized Center for World-Class Universities (known for the Shanghai Rankings – ARWU) at Shanghai Jiao Tong University. The initiative continues to engage with additional partners to provide capacity building and technical assistance.

- a. Objectives of the Benchmarking Initiative
  - Enable African universities to improve their performance based on comparative standardized data and metrics (meeting a set of minimum standards)
  - Provide information to country level policy makers to assess progress of the participating universities
  - Build capacity in an African institution to manage and analyze the data
- b. Status update
  - Mini-pilot of 7 universities in 2014
  - Launched in Accra in November 2015
  - Scaled-up pilot with 31 universities in 2016 (48 had signed up)
  - Capacity building workshop in Abuja (50 + universities)
- c. The selected host institution for the Benchmarking Initiative will
  - Facilitate and establish Benchmarking, Graduate Tracer Studies and related activities in the region;
  - Engage in relevant capacity building activities under the initiative for higher education institutions and national agencies
  - Build partnerships with international experts and organizations to support the initiative

The graduate tracer study is an important component of the Benchmarking Initiative which will be rolled out next year. The graduate tracer study tool will be developed with experts from MyCOS Data, specializing in higher education management consulting with over 900 + university clients in China. At the workshop, MyCos Data presented on:

- a. The benefits of graduate tracer studies:
  - Data-driven understanding of graduates' career development can be used to improve student recruitment and career services.
  - Determine whether an academic program can appropriately meet a region's labor market demand and economic development. Survey results may be used to identify and improve problem areas.
  - Monitor the progress of education objectives and provide hard evidence for improving teaching and learning.
- b. Overview of how the graduate tracer study is carried out in China, how survey takers are incentivized, the typical response rates and ways MyCOS attempts to increase the rates as well as the modes through which the surveys are taken (mobile, tablets, PCs)
- c. Sample indicators and a typical tracer study project flow
  - Sample indicators include broad areas such as skills and knowledge of the graduate, post-graduation outlook, employment status, campus experience and teaching feedback. The final list of indicators and the methodology will be shared with all participating institutions for feedback and suggestions
  - The typical tracer study and analytics project flow used at MyCOS starts from the Survey preparation which feeds into an online smart survey (data collection) and then Data cleaning, Data analysis and finally report writing.

**Next Steps:** Carry out an initial survey among the ACEs to determine various aspects of the graduate tracer study (Nov 2017), including

- Determine if ACEs have the needed contact information (emails) of their graduates and enough contacts to allow the graduate tracer study to be meaningful
- Ways to incentivize graduate tracer study survey takers
- Through what medium can the highest response rate be guaranteed
- What kinds of indicators would be most beneficial to the ACEs
- Develop a graduate tracer study tool
- Update benchmarking tool in preparation for the next round
- Sign-up by ACEs and universities to participate in both the benchmarking and tracer study
- Next round of benchmarking/pilot tracer study (Feb./Mar 2018)
- Selection of an African Institution to host the initiative (early 2018). Call for proposals in a week or two!

### 3. RSC MEETING (NOVEMBER 10, 2017)

The RSC members together with the World Bank Team and IUCEA convened on the last day of the workshop to hold the 8<sup>th</sup> semi-annual RSC meeting. The introductory remarks were given by the chair, Dr. Kojo Appiah on behalf of the RSC, Dr. Alexandre Lyambabaje on behalf of IUCEA, and Dr. Xiaoyan Liang on behalf of the World Bank. The agenda was adopted following the remarks. The meeting began with the approval of the minutes from the 7<sup>th</sup> RSC meeting. The following are some of the points discussed (see Annex E for RSC meeting action points):

- **Independent verifier.** It is expected that the RSC committee will carry out technical evaluation of RFP of 5 firms shortlisted for independent verifier by 11-15<sup>th</sup> December, 2017. The negotiations will be carried out by February so the firm can start consultancy by 12<sup>th</sup> March, 2018.
- **Component 2 and female enrollment.** The component is worth 3 million USD, that includes 1.5 million for scholarships and remaining for capacity building at the regional level. It was proposed that IUCEA should hire a technical expert in consultation with WB to support development of incubation centers by four disciplines (Industry, Agriculture, Health and Education/Statistics). Since the issue of female enrollment remains a concern for ACEs, it was also proposed that 60 MSc scholarships be provided to female graduate students.
- **Hiring of staff by IUCEA.** IUCEA is currently in the process of hiring additional specialized staff to oversee the M&E, procurement and audit.
  - **M&E Officer.** Of the 4 candidates that were recommended for the final scoring, Mr. Samson Ojesi has been invited to start contract negotiations during the week of November 13, 2017 and contract signed after the diligence process being carried out by IUCEA.
  - **Procurement Assistant & Audit Consultant.** The process is underway and it is expected that the interviews of shortlisted candidates will take place during the evaluation of technical proposal of independent verifier firm.
- **Technical support missions to ACEs.** Due to lack of proper communication in the past on technical support missions, some countries were visited separately by WB and IUCEA teams. It was thus proposed that missions be harmonized through mutual participation of WB and IUCEA. IUCEA will develop a schedule of joint missions to ACEs for the next 6 months and submit to the WB by December 2017.

- **ToRs for RSC members.** Due to absence of five RSC members at the current meeting, it was proposed that the ToRs for RSC members be reviewed to attain clarity on conditions to replace members in case of no shows/ absenteeism, required quorum to hold meetings etc.
- **Sustainability of ACEs.** The RSC members agreed to play advocacy roles for NSC with host university leadership to allow ACEs to operate with some autonomy, while at the same time be fully integrated into university activities.
- **Zimbabwe ACE.** Zimbabwe ACE (ACE-SFS) was previously selected into the ACE II project, but was limited to its IDA borrowing ineligibility. The committee proposed that country office in Harare liaise with the DC office to assess the possibility of ACE-SFS to benefit from ACEII funding. The TTL for the project will consult with WB lawyers to assess the possibility further.

#### 4. WAY FORWARD AND NEXT STEPS

Based on the discussions between ACEs, IUCEA and Bank team, several next steps were decided. For **ACEs**, the next steps are: (i) prepare the new annual work plan for 2018 (most country AWP are due by March 31, 2018; three countries have AWP due by November 30); (ii) submission of the first project IFR by February 15, 2018 based on the template provided in their respective disbursement letters; (iii) begin/continue implementation as per AWP;

The next steps identified for **IUCEA** are:

- update the work plan and procurement plan associated with Component 2 by December 15, 2017;
- develop plan for joint WB and IUCEA implementation support missions for the next 6 months by December 15, 2017;
- prepare expression of interest from ACEs and criteria for selection of incubators by January 15, 2018
- develop draft operational manual for the ACEII master scholarship program by January 15, 2018
- review annual work plans submitted by ACEs
- recruit an independent verifier by February, 2018 and plan for 1<sup>st</sup> phase (pilot) verification by March, 2018

The next steps for the **WB** are:

- 1s disbursement to Zambia ACEs
- country TTLs to follow up with national steering committees to ensure continuous support are being provided to ACEs;
- country TTLs to follow up with respective country ACEs to provide continuous technical and implementation support including financial management, disbursement, and safeguards.
- WB core ACEII team will institute monthly management meeting with IUCEA,
- prepare a TOR for recruitment of host for benchmarking to be held in February 2018 (PASET)
- work with IUCEA to recruit consultant for graduate tracer study
- develop a draft DLI verification protocol by November 30, 2017;
- provide standard word and PPT template for recording project progress by November 30, 2017

**ANNEX A**  
**NOTES FROM JOINT WORKSHOP HELPDESK DISCUSSIONS**  
**(FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT, PERFORMANCE REVIEW AND M&E)**

*Financial Management & Disbursement*  
*Lourdes Consuelo & Issa Thiam*

**Key issues discussed in the plenary and Help Desk sessions**

- The review of the operation model, funds flow and reporting of the project taking into consideration the result-based approach and use of DLIs/DLRs. The Bank team highlighted the importance of the timely coordination of the different actors involved in the implementation, including, ACEs' technical and fiduciary teams, hosting university's managerial, administrative and finance teams, as well as IU-CEA, independent verifier and WB. Although ACEs have already received a first disbursement based on DLI 1, they are still at an early stage, and it is still a bit difficult to fully assimilate the dynamics of this approach, and it will therefore require that as part of the implementation support the Bank team and IUCEA continue reinforcing the concepts, and guiding the process.
- **Use of DLIs/DLRs and EEPs.** Building on the result-based model, the team explained the definition of EEPs, highlighting that as discussed during project preparation, EEPs should be primarily (and preferably) covered with university's salaries. If for any reason, the spending in salaries were not sufficient to cover (document) the disbursements expected to be made to the ACE, some other non-procurable operating cost would be identified making sure that related budget codes are explicitly identified. If there is any case for which the salaries and selected operating costs are still not sufficient to cover such amount, then further discussion would be held between the Bank, hosting university and ACE, to define inclusion of other expenditures. **(Action required:** During the next FM supervision, the Bank team together with hosting university/ACE's teams will review and/or reconfirm the availability of sufficient EEPs (as explained above) to document disbursements envisioned under each ACE).
- **Financial Reporting and audit requirements.** The team explained the reporting and audit requirements under the project, clarifying their purpose, content and format as follows: IFR (Sources and Uses of Funds and sources of funds) designed to monitor the implementation each ACE's approved Implementation Plan (and annual work plans); ii) Statement of EEPs to report the eligible expenditures (as defined before, e.g salaries) paid by the university, and which are to be used to support the withdrawal of funds upon achievement and independent verification of the DLIs/DLRs. It was emphasized that while the preparation of the IFR relies mainly within the ACE, the data and supporting document for the preparation of the Statement of EEPs needs to be coordinated with the university's finance/administrative units.
- **FM related DLIs.** The team went over the four DLRs under DLI 3. Timely, transparent and institutionally reviewed financial management (FM related DLIs), and discussed the actions that need to be completed and evidence that would need to be submitted to the Bank (mainly based on additional guidance prepared under ACE I. The discussion highlighted that achievement of those DLRs (mainly 3.2 functional audit committee, 3.2 functional internal audit; and 3.3 transparency of financial management) require working with specific units within the hosting universities. **(Action required:** ACE teams will need to start discussion with the hosting universities on the tasks needed for the achievement of the DLRs. Based on the due dates for IFRs, and audit reports, the proposal would be to measure the achievement of the FM related DLIs after June, 2018.)



- **FM staff needed** to support implementation. Based on the arrangements agreed during the preparation, there are some ACEs, where accountants have not been recruited yet, or where the current arrangement for instance relying on hosting university's own units may need to be strengthened to allow smooth implementation. (**Action required:** where needed, ACEs will discuss with hosting universities, alternative to enhance the current arrangements, which might be discussed during next supervision mission).
- **Disbursement and DLIs.** The team explained the disbursement requirements under the project, clarifying their mechanism, content and format as follows: i) Statement of EEPs to report the eligible expenditures (as defined before, e.g. salaries) paid by the university, ii) the DLIs verification certificate from the independent verifier and iii) confirmation from country director and/or task team leader that the Association have received the evidences of the DLIs fulfillment and they are satisfactory, which are to be used to support the withdrawal of funds (reimbursement of DLI).

*Country: Ethiopia*

*Country TTL: Girma*

### **Notes from Discussions on General Performance Evaluation of Climate SABC, Haramaya University, Ethiopia**

**Center Leader and Vice President for Academic Affairs: Prof. Niguisse Dechassa**

**Deputy Center Director: Bobi Bedadi, PhD.**

**Finance Officer: Abera Molla**

- Initially the center planned to start admission of students and program launching in October but extended by two months because of logistic problems. Dormitories for regional students are getting refurbished and procurements are made to that end. The center director said they hope to finalize renovation and start the program in December
- The center has started preparing to welcome students from regional countries. Towards that end letters have been written to the emigration authorities to process the visa and residency permits.
- The center expects to admit 55 students in three masters and one PhD program out of which 14 students are from regional countries
- All curricula of both masters and PhD programs are approved by the university's senate, by the board of the university and the ministry of education of the federal government of Ethiopia
- There is a strong ownership of the center within the university structure. The fact that the center leader is vice president for academic affairs of the university has helped in speeding up the curricula approval and accommodating the center within the university's structure. The center is housed within the college of agriculture and environmental sciences as an independent entity. The deputy center director has a position that is equivalent to a college/faculty dean.
- Regarding hiring of support staff; the center has finalized recruiting project manager, communication officer, procurement officer, finance officer and training and research officer. However, the center has not hired M&E officer. The bank advised the center to designate training and research officer for the task of monitoring and evaluation.

### **Challenges**

1. The university **procurement** follows the centralized government procurement procedure which takes very long time. According to the center director it takes up to one year to finalize the procurement of a vehicle. To solve procurement related problems, the center is advised to closely

work with Ato Shemelis who is a procurement person at the bank. Moreover, the three centers hosted at Addis Ababa University (AAU) are working with the bank to develop a procurement guideline that will solve the challenges the ACEs are facing. Climate SABC is advised to join the ACEs based at AAU to find solution to the procurement challenges.

2. International/regional **accreditation**. The center has not yet identified regional or international accreditation body in climate smart agriculture. The bank suggested to use the services of IUCEA to facilitate regional accreditation on top of learning from the experiences of ACE I universities who managed to secure regional/international accreditations
3. Exorbitant **cost of professional fees** for professors coming from international universities. The center director raised the issue of very expensive professors coming from western universities. Although the center has very good working relations with partners like university of Purdue, some professors coming from western universities are very expensive. The bank advised to strengthen South-South cooperation with universities in China, Korea and India
4. No assistance from the **national steering committee**. The center director complained that the national steering committee is not providing tangible assistance in solving the challenges facing the centers in Ethiopia. The steering committee has not met to discuss with center leaders and was not responsive to the repeated requests of the centers to meet and discuss progress of the centers in the country. The bank promised to follow this with the concerned authorities of the national steering committee.

*Country: Mozambique*

*Country TTL: Ana Ruth Menzes*

#### **MZ- ACEII Center of Excellence for the area of Oil and Gas (CS-OGET)**

##### **Summary of Technical Meetings held in Accra - November 7-9 2017 with inputs from the implementation support mission held in October 2017**

- The Center has been created within UEM which permitted the designation of a Director and allows the room for the appropriate staffing;
- Effectiveness took place in March 14, 2017 and to the official launching of the center took place May 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2017 which was followed by the disbursement of funds related to fulfillment of DLI 1 in June 2017;
- Current training: Two programs are ongoing which were developed with involvement of private sector, MSc of Petroleum Engineering and MSc in Hydrocarbon Processing Engineering;
- Faculty: The center counts with 3 lecturers with PhD level trained in Norway and 8 Junior lecturers who received additional training in China and Italy and is planning to finance the training of 1 PhD lecturer in Geosciences in Nigeria. It was agreed that a Capacity Development plan will be developed and related activities included in the AWP.
- Regional Students: The registration of 8 students from different countries indicates the relevance of the field for the region.
- Development of new masters' programs: Preparatory activities aimed at the introduction of two new MSc, **Safety and Environmental** Engineering for the Petroleum Engineering in 2018 and Petroleum Geology in 2019 are underway. The Center aims to follow an inclusive process of development of these new programs through the involvement of private sector and other relevant stakeholders;
- Quality Assurance: The plan is to undergo external national accreditation in 2018 in preparation for international/regional accreditation. Discussions with the National Council for Quality Assurance (CNAQ) took place in August and guidance has been provided on the roadmap to apply for the national

accreditation. The center is due to prepare the process of self-evaluation and submit the report to CNAQ for review which will lead to the external evaluation by CNAQ in the first semester of 2018.

Some of the challenges encountered by the center is the development of meaningful research, attraction of students from the region and the effective operationalization of MoUs undertaken with the private sector. Aware of these challenges the Center is working with relevant partners towards its visibility. Another area that requires attention is procurement planning and execution.

**Procurement:** In respect to procurement relevant staff from UEM participated in two training sessions provided by the Bank. During the October implementation support mission led by the Bank the fiduciary and safeguard areas deserved attention. The Bank team aimed to review the processes of procurement undertaken by the center and aimed to assist with the implementation of DLI 4 and following was observed:

- Progress: Regarding procurement activities it was observed that the Center completed the following procurement activities: the purchasing of Double Cab 4X4 vehicle, office furniture and technological equipment. Procurement activities were done based in the AWP of activities using national procurement procedures. The Bank team reviewed the procedures followed and rated as **Satisfactory (S)**.
- Procurement Audit: Regarding the procurement auditor, it was agreed that because Tribunal Administrative does not have capacity to carry out a Procurement Audit an independent auditor will be contracted to carry out the work. The Bank team shared with the project team the Terms of Reference for an Independent Auditor and the recruitment process is expected to start shortly.
- Procurement Plan: The Center was advised to prepare the procurement plan for the upcoming activities based on the AWP which will be shared with the Bank team by November 17th.

**Financial Management:** The Bank team reviewed the project financial management arrangement and reviewed the processes being executed by the center and considered it **Satisfactory (S)**. In relation to the agreements on next steps for FM in relation to DLI 3 the following have been discussed and agreed:

- IFRs: Considering the effectiveness date and mainly first disbursement date, it was agreed that IFR cut-off date for the purposes of DLR 3.1 will be December 2017, which should be submitted to the Bank within 45 days, being the due date February 15, 2018.
- The content and format of the IFRs was again discussed. It was reiterated that IFRs should include: i) Statement of EEPs (for the period disbursements are being requested), and ii) statement of sources and uses of funds, and statement of uses of funds reporting against the annual work plans. In the meantime, training for the ACE team has been provided based on the formats included in project documents. It was agreed that the Bank team will provide a refreshment before IFR submission;
- Audit arrangement: The university is currently using an independent audit firm whose contract is still valid. The audit firm has been validated to audit Bank-financed operations in Mozambique, and there is auditor rotation every four years. The current contract includes the 2018 audit, and therefore, after two years the audit firm will change.

*Country: Kenya*

*Country TTL: Ruth Karimi Charo*

**Inputs from the Aide Memoire, Accra ACE I&II Workshop November 7-9 2017**

**Jaramogi Oginga Odinga university of science and technology, Africa center of excellence in sustainable use of insects as food and feeds (INSEFOODS)**

This is the only Kenya Centre that had signed up for the Performance support help desk.

a) *Funds:*

- First disbursement for DLR. 1 US\$ 1.1 About 10% utilized

b) *Programs.*

- Previously, no existing Masters and PHD programs at JOOUST
- JOOUST resubmitted the revised Masters and PHD programs to the Kenya Commission of University Education (CUE) for further review
- CUE has initiated the review process of the resubmitted programs. The Centre is requested to very closely follow up with MoE/RSC and CUE . The World Bank team will also support with the follow up.

c) *Faculty development.*

- Agreed JOOUST will submit a staff development plan, based on needs assessment of relevant staff, by November 30<sup>th</sup>.

d) *Short Course*

- This is initiated. Curriculum is being developed.

**Other aide memoire inputs from the discussions in the sessions that I attended**

a) *Monitoring and Evaluation*

- There is need for a standard format and schedule by when Centers are required to submit data and to who.
- Credible/reliable contacts for each enrolled student, including in short courses is required for accounting-verification process
- Beneficiary surveys. This are required for students enrolled in the programs
- Tracer studies. Centers need to begin to plan for this, including development of the designs and tools.
- Need for regular virtual meetings with the ACEs to track progress and address emerging issues in a timely manner. Bank and IUCEA will share a proposed VC schedule for each Country.

b) *Publication*

- Need to be related to the Centre's objectives and programs
- The Bank will clarify with IUCEA whether verification of publications will be done by a separate firm

c) *Fiduciary*

- Procurement. PP required for the annual workplan. The PP is for planning purposes, and to support DLI.4 implementation and monitoring.
- FM: FM colleagues will provide detailed input. Some highlights:
  - First IFRs due February 15, 2018. The IFR templates provided in the respective disbursement letters should be used. Centre's accountants encouraged to touch base with relevant Country office FM support for support as need arises.
  - Audit report. Required both for the host university and the Centers. For the host, University, audit should cover payroll/salaries-because of the IFR EEP.
  - The audit could be one with schedules covering University payroll and the Centers. Otherwise two separate reports are acceptable

- Audit reports must be submitted on time-as per the FA provisions. Delays can lead to remedies on the credit
- d) *Role of Industry/private sector*
  - Centers need to engage industry/private sector through structured partnerships /MoUs
  - IUCEA and WB team will continue to work together and guide Centers on industry engagements, and create platforms for the same
  - MoUs with Industry need to also explore internships for students and short term hire-Centers can pay for this if need be. This will enhance chances of employability for the graduates
- e) *Accreditation*
  - Seeking national, regional and international accreditation is good. However, Centers need to put in place institutional mechanisms for continuous upgrade of centers through stakeholder's engagements and tracer studies among others.
- f) *Revenue Generation DLR.*
  - There seems to be an understanding among the Centers that revenue may be considered 'in kind'. Revenue for the DLRs refers to 'cash'
  - In kind contribution, can be considered under MoUs/Partnerships
  - IUCEA and the WB team will further clarify each DLRs and DLIs and update the POM accordingly.
- g) *National Steering Committee(NSC).*
  - The NSC seems not be meeting in several Countries.
  - There is need for WB to write to MoEs and remind them of this obligation under the PFAs.

**Country: Malawi**

**Country TTL: Innocent**

### **Issues discussed by ACEs working on Agriculture**

1. *Institutional high level support key to success.* The best performing ACEs in phase 1 reported to have regular high-level support from the respective university management bodies. Information sharing and exposure visits were identified as essential elements in attracting management support. Equally important were the university financial and accounting personnel. ACEs were thus urged to ensure effective and regular engagement with their management teams.
2. *The ACE platform and exchange programs.* It was noted that the already established ACE platform provided an opportunity for masters & PhD student exchange programs as well as faculty. Institutions committed to continued networking to explore possibility of student and staff exchange programs.
3. *Inspiration for new areas of research.* The discussions conducted enabled peer learning including broadening the institutions' vision on agricultural related research that could be incorporated in their research plans. For example, the ACEs working on crops urged the ACE working on edible insects to expand the scope to embrace insects that fed on food crops.
4. *Incentivizing students was essential for stronger linkages with industry.* Creating partnerships was still a major challenge by most ACE II institutions. Several lessons were learnt from well performing ACE Is on this area. Most importantly, the linkage with students' research activities/cycles seemed to generate more lasting results. CADESSE internship model was one of the impressive approaches shared. Students undertake one year of face to face training, after which they are attached to industries of interest for 6 months. During the 6 months, the students work with the industrial teams

identifying challenges to effective operations. The interns then return to institutions with a list of research questions and knowledge gaps informed by the identified challenges from which they choose a thesis research topic. They conduct the research in full collaboration with the industrial team. Student supervision is conducted by a team embracing both the university and the industry personnel. Upon completion of their studies, students are immediately integrated in the industries because of the relevance of their research to industrial operations.

5. *Improving visibility and capacity of partners.* Visibility of partnerships as well as sustainability of partners' commitments to the ACEs was an emerging challenge. Strategies of overcoming this challenge were discussed including sponsorship of partners to attend international conferences and workshops, involving them in various activities of the universities for enhanced efficiency.
6. *Proposal to broaden the category of 'committed funds' beyond contractual obligations.* It was observed that 'committed funds' only related to contractual processes with special focus to civil works and consultancy contracts. However, enrolled students' scholarship funds, for example, were identified to be 'committed' too and thus deserve to be categorized as committed. Follow up with the financial management team was recommended.
7. *Possibility of supporting hard ware under ACE II.* In a bid to improve the quality of programs, ACE IIs presented a proposal to incorporate some infrastructural elements linked to student learning in their plans. The meeting could not resolve this but further discussions with the IUCEA and the World Bank were encouraged. Areas identified included students' laboratories, accommodation for female students, etc.

### **Malawi Key Issues and Agreed Actions for the ACEs**

1. Project monitoring and evaluation. The ACE team obtained guidance on aspects of project monitoring and evaluation. Clarity was provided on the key elements to be monitored. Advice provided centred on what needs to be monitored which included: (a) progress of activities against each planned activity under the approved Annual Work Plans (AWPs), which was derived from the five year implementation plan; (b) the procurement process as per the approved procurement plan governing project operations – both ACEs submitted procurement plans which are already in the World Bank STEP system; (c) progress against the agreed project targets for the respective results indicators stipulated in the DLI matrix as well as the broader project results framework. Emphasis was placed on the need to review and adhere to the indicator definitions put against respective results for accurate data capture and progress reporting. Clear steps on what needs to be done follow up to the World Bank's clearance of next year's AWP by the World Bank.
2. Going forward, sustained guidance will be provided by the in-country task team to ensure respective institutions establish an M&E system with clear specification of the reporting intervals by data & information type. This will be routinely monitored at the bi-monthly review meetings to ensure functionality of the system.
3. Tracer studies. The TTL informed the broader task team that through the ongoing Malawi Skills Development (SDP), the ACEs had secured technical assistance towards the design of the tracer studies for their respective programs. This arose from the fact that the SDP had extended similar support to the 5 beneficiary institutions with special focus on the priority STEM programs under the overall leadership and coordination of the National Council for Higher Education (NCHE). As a result,

Malawi has in place a Tracer Studies National Task Force along with a nationally owned and standardized tool. For purposes of standardization purposes, it was deemed necessary to have similar standards apply to the Malawi ACEs. The contract for the consultant to provide the similar technical support to the ACEs had been concluded by the NCHE pending commencement of the assignment.

4. Going forward, it was recommended that the Malawi Tracer Studies national tool gets shared with the regional task team including details about the consultant to provide more clarity about the assignment and what will be done for Malawi. Duplication of efforts would then be minimized without compromise to anticipated quality standards.
5. Human resource capacity challenges. Capacity challenges with respect to delivery and supervision of PhD students were observed with specific focus – though not limited to, the ACEPHERM. Arising from shortage of a critical mass of specialized skills in STEM, relying on national partnerships with existing universities to support delivery of these programs may not be sustainable since the same partners would also be struggling to meet their staff requirements at their respective institutions. It was recommended that in addition to the already identified national partnerships, the ACEs may consider reaching out to other countries within and outside the region to furnish their staffing needs in the short-term as they endeavor to develop internal capacity through staff development. Use of expatriate professorial personnel was recommended including identifying those that would need to undertake Sabbatical leaves. The latter would also be cheaper for the institutions. The regional platform that already exists would be a good starting point for the search for such personnel from within the region.

*Country: Tanzania*

*Country TTL: Kaboko*

#### **UPDATES FROM 4 TANZANIA AFRICAN CENTRE OF EXCELLENCES**

##### **A. Centre Operations**

- All four centers, two at Nelson Mandela Institute of Technology and Sokoine University of Agriculture have been established and are fully running.
- All key staff at the four centers including Centre Managers, Procurement, Financial Management and M&E have been appointed and officially supporting centers functions.
- All centers became effective from January 2017 followed by disbursement of funds after DLI 1.1 in May, 2017. The official launching of 4 centers was conducted on August 23, 2017 at Nelson Mandela Institute of Technology.

##### **B. Implementation Progress.**

- Review of curriculum. all 4 Centers have reported good progress in curriculum reviews whereby some programs have already been approved by Tanzania Commissions for University while others are in the final stages of approval. CREATES and WISE at NM have established a total of 18 new programs
- Students admissions are on track. All 4 centers have reported impressive performance on student enrolment. A total of 32 Msc and 54 Phd students have been admitted in all 4 centers.

- Regional students. All programs in four centers have attracted adequate number of regional students. Most of centers have reported registration of 50%-35% of students from the region, hence surpassing the target. However, number of female student's enrolment is still low.
- Short course. CREATES have conducted two short courses with a total of 35 participants. The rest of centers plan conduct short courses from January 2017. CREATES in collaboration with one Chinese University has designed a very innovative pedagogy program for University teaching staff to improve the capacity of teaching staff in classroom delivery of lessons and student support. The program will be available to all Universities staff from January 2017 and thereafter to all Universities in the country and the region. SUA also is planning management courses for universities staff.
- Partnership. All centers have reported encouraging initiative in partnering with local and international institutions, all leading on international collaboration with Universities and Research institutions.

#### C. Challenges.

Key reported challenges include:

- Getting female students in some programs both local and from the region
- WISE center still face a challenge to recruit students from the region. This could be associated with competition with other Universities in the region
- Need for capacity building for new Centre staff in areas of fiducially, social and safeguard management.

#### D. Key Agreement

- A min mission for fiducially, social and safeguards will be conducted in January 2017. The date for the mission will be communicated to all ACEs later.
- All ACEs have requested WB to organize training on fiduciary, social and safeguard management to all project staff.



**ANNEX B**  
**JOINT ACE I & ACE II PROJECTS WORKSHOP (NOVEMBER 7-9, 2017)**

<b>DAY ONE: TUESDAY, 7 NOVEMBER 2017</b>	
Arrival of Participants/Registration <u>Facilitator:</u> Mrs. Gabrielle Hansen	8:00am – 8:30am
Recognition of all participants Welcome remarks by (i) WB Task Team Leaders – Mr. Andreas Blom & Dr. Xiaoyan Liang (ii) AAU Secretary General, Prof. Etienne Ehile; IUCEA Executive Secretary, Prof. Alexandre Lyambabaje (iii) Introduction of Partners - Prof. Jonathan Mba & Dr. Eugene Mutimura <u>Facilitators:</u> Prof. Jonathan Mba & Dr. Eugene Mutimura	9:00am – 9:30am
Opening address by (i) WB Country Director for Ghana, Sierra Leone and Liberia- Mr. Henry Kerali and/or WB Regional Country Director and Nigeria Country Director-Rachid Benmessaoud (ii) Representative of the Hon. Minister of Education (TBC) <u>Facilitator:</u> Mrs. Eunice Ackwerh-Senior Education Specialist-World Bank	9:30am -10:00am
<b>GROUP PHOTOGRAPH/TEA/COFFEE BREAK</b>	10:00am – 10:30am
<b><u>Agenda Item 2: ACE 1 &amp; ACE 2 Project Progress</u></b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ACE 1 Progress report               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Results Progress, including disbursement and budget execution (Mrs. Adeline Addy and Mrs Himdat Bayusuf)</li> <li>○ AAU Facilitation Activities (Prof. Jonathan Mba)</li> <li>○ ACE I Supervision Mission Findings (Academic Experts)</li> </ul> </li> <li>• ACE 2 Progress report               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Results progress including disbursement and budget execution (Dr. Eugene Mutimura)</li> <li>○ IUCEA/RFU Facilitation Activities</li> <li>○ Supervision findings and Component 2 progress (Dr. Eugene Mutimura)</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Q&amp;A</li> </ul>	10:30am-11:30am
<u>Facilitator:</u> Prof Salifu-Executive Secretary, National Commission for Tertiary Education (NCTE)-Ghana and ACE 1 PSC Member	11:30am-12:30pm
	12:30pm-1:00pm
<b>LUNCH</b>	1:00pm-2:00pm

<b>Parallel Sessions</b>					
<b><u>Working group 1:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: general group and 4 sub-groups including (i) Transport and ICT/Applied Math (ii) Water (iii) Engineering-Material Science/Oil & Gas/Energy and Railway (iv) Statistics & Education (Prof. M. Diallo, Gen. X. Michel) Prof Mayunga Nkunya	<b><u>Working Group 2:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Agriculture (Prof. R. Wahome and Dr. C. Larsen)  Prof David Mkwambisi (Agriculture Expert)	<b><u>Working group 3:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Health (Prof. M. Niescierenko Prof. H. Galadanci)  Prof N Kiwanuka Health Expert	<b><u>Performance and Support Discussion</u></b>  ACE I: Nigeria discussion 2:00 – 4:00 pm Senegal-4.00pm-5.00pm Burkina Faso 5.00pm-6.00pm  ACE II: Centers are being identified and will be communicated separately	<b><u>ACE Helpdesks</u></b>  <u>ACE I M&amp;E Verification Helpdesk:</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Adeline & Moustapha)  <u>ACE II M&amp;E Verification Helpdesk:</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Nobuyuki Tanaka & Maulshree Gangwar)  <u>ACE I Disbursement support-</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Aissatou Diallo, Michel De Marigny)  <u>ACE II FM &amp; Disbursement support-</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Lourdes Consuelo & Issa Thiam)	2.00pm-5.00pm
Guidance on sector working groups will be provided by the facilitators prior to the meetings. Objective of the sector working groups is to introduce each center under ACE I and ACE II and provide opportunities to learn and understand the different center focus for potential collaboration opportunities and peer learning. Additionally, time during these sectors working groups will be provided to invited selected partners to present themselves to the ACEs for potential partnerships					
<b>DINNER</b>					<b>7.00PM</b>
<b>DAY TWO: WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017</b>					
<b>Plenary Session on International Accreditation and Quality Assurance (Prof. Michel Cosnard from HCERES and Dr. Joe Turner from ABET)</b> Chair: Honorable Minister of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology of Gambia, Mr. Badara A. Joof					9:00am-10:00am

<b>Plenary Session on Verification and Monitoring and Evaluation process under the ACE Project-Success, challenges and improvements- Mrs. Himdat Bayusuf and Adeline Addy</b>					10.00-10.30am
Tea/ Coffee Break					10:30am-11:00am
<b>Plenary Session on Financial Management (Aissatou Diallo-Senior Finance Officer -ACE I &amp; Lourdes Consuelo Linares-ACE II)</b>					11:00am-11:30am
Parallel Sessions					
<b><u>Working group 1:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: general group and 4 sub-groups including (i) ICT (ii) Water (iii) Material Science (iv) Statistics & Education) (Prof. M. Diallo, Gen. X. Michel) Prof Mayunga Nkunya	<b><u>Working Group 2:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Agriculture (Prof. R. Wahome and Dr. C. Larsen)	<b><u>Working group 3:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Health (Prof. M. Niescierenko Prof. H. Galadanci)	<b><u>Performance and Support Discussion</u></b>  ACE I: Benin 11.30 – 1.00pm  ACE II: Centers are being identified and will be communicated separately	<b><u>ACE Helpdesks</u></b>  <u>ACE I M&amp;E Verification Helpdesk:</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Adeline & Moustapha)  <u>ACE I Disbursement support-</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Aissatou Diallo, Michel De Marigny)  <u>ACE II FM &amp; Disbursement support-</u> ACEs to sign up for sessions (Lourdes Consuelo & Issa Thiam)	11:30am – 1:00pm
<b>LUNCH</b>					1.00pm-2.00pm
Parallel Sessions					
<b><u>Working group 1:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: general group and 4 sub-groups including (i) ICT (ii) Water	<b><u>Working Group 2:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Agriculture (Prof. R. Wahome and Dr. C. Larsen)	<b><u>Working group 3:</u></b> ACE Networking Collaborative networks: Health (Prof. M. Niescierenko Prof. H. Galadanci)	<b><u>Performance and Support Discussion</u></b>  ACE I: Cote d'Ivoire 2:00 – 3:00 pm	<b><u>ACE Helpdesks</u></b>  <u>ACE I M&amp;E Verification Helpdesk:</u> ACEs to sign up for hourly sessions: (Adeline & Moustapha)  <u>ACE II: FM &amp; Procurement Helpdesk</u>	2:00pm – 4.00pm

(iii) Material Science (iv) Statistics & Education) (Prof. M. Diallo, Gen. X. Michel)  Prof Mayunga Nkunya			Cameroon 3.00pm-4.00pm  ACE II: Centers are being identified and will be communicated separately	<u>ACE I and II-Disbursement support- ACEs</u> to sign up for sessions Issa Thiam and Michel De Marigny	
<b>Plenary Session on Graduate tracer studies and institutional benchmarking (required for ACEIIs and optional for ACEI)</b> Dr. Boqing Wang (MyCos Data) Facilitator: Ekuia Bentil					4:00pm – 5:00pm
<b>DAY THREE: THURSDAY, 9 NOVEMBER 2017</b>					
<b>Plenary session on university industry linkage</b> Speakers: Dr Ivan Twagirishema (Rwanda CEO of Ngali Holdings), Richard Edema of Uganda MaCCRI, Daniel Redda of Ethiopia ARERI, and Prof. Longbai Wei (China Zhejiang University) Facilitator: Javier Botero (Lead Education Specialist, World Bank)					9.00am – 10.00 am
<b>Thematic Reporting from Experts</b>					10:00am-11.00am
<b>ACE Project Workshop Wrap Up</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Potential ACE Scale-up</li> <li>- Important Decisions</li> <li>- ACE Monitoring &amp; Supervision Missions and other Key Next Steps</li> <li>- ACE Project Evaluation Survey</li> <li>- Brief Closing Remarks</li> </ul> <u>Facilitators:</u> Mr. Andreas Blom & Dr. Xiaoyan Liang / Prof. Jonathan Mba & Dr. Eugene Mutimura					11.00am-1.00pm
<b>LUNCH</b>					1.00pm - 2:00PM
<b>Site visits to WACCI and WACCBIP at the University of Ghana, Legon</b>					3.00pm - 5:00PM

**ANNEX C**  
**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS FROM THE ACEs**

Country	Name of ACE	Institution	Participants	Title
<b>ETHIOPIA</b>	ESC 20 African Centre of Excellence for Climate Smart Agriculture and Biodiversity Conservation (Climate SABC)	Haramaya University	1.Prof. Nigussie Dechassa 2.Dr. Bobe Bedadi Woreka 3.Mr. Yinebeb Alemu Asres	
	ESC 42 Centre for Innovative Drug Development & Therapeutic Trials for Africa (CDT-Africa)	Addis Ababa University	1.Dr. Abebaw Fekadu 2.Prof. Eyasu Makonnen 3.Dr Tsegahun Manyazewal	
	ESC 55 ACE for Water Management (ACEWM)	Addis Ababa University	1.Dr. Feleke Zewge 2.Dr. Shibru Temesgen 3.Dr. Seifu Kebede –	
	ESC 74 African Railway Education & Research Institute (ARERI)	Addis Ababa University	1.Dr. Daniel Tilahun REDDA 2. Dr. Beteley Tekola MESHESHA 3. Mr. Anteneh Zewdu 4. Mr. Belete Abebe Yobrehu	
<b>KENYA</b>	ESC 02 Centre of Excellence in Sustainable Agriculture & Agribusiness Management (CESAAM)	Egerton University	1.Prof. George Owuor 2.Prof. Samuel Mwonga 3.Prof. Alfred Chingi Kibor 4.Gabriel Ndungu	
	ESC 34 Sustainable Use of Insects as Food and Feeds (INSEFOODS)	Jaramogi Odinga Oginga University of Science & Technology	1. Prof. Adrian Mukhebi 2. Wilkister Akinyi Baraza 3. William Kala Akobi 4. Prof. Stephen Gaya Agong 5. Prof. Monica Ayieko	
	ESC 59 Centre of Excellence in Phytochemicals Textiles and Renewable Energy (PTRE)	Moi University	1. Mr. Kirwa Chirchir 2. Prof. Simeon Mining 3. Dr. Rose Ramkat 4. Prof. Ambrose Kiprop	
<b>MALAWI</b>			1.Prof. Emmanuel Kaunda 2.Dr Phillip F.D. Kaonda	

	ESC 26 Centre of Excellence for Aquaculture and Fisheries Science (Aquafish)	Lilongwe University of Agriculture & Natural Resources (LUANAR)	3. Dr Joseph Kuyamba Dzanja 4. Mr. Petterson Nachanje 5. Dr. Samson Mbewe	RSC member
	ESC 48 Centre for Public Health and Herbal Medicine (CEPHEM)	University of Malawi - Malawi College of Medicine	1. Prof. Adamson Muula 2. Dr. Fanuel Lampiao 3. Mr. Palinji Mungoni	
<b>MOZAMBIQUE</b>	ESC 111 Center of Studies in Oil and Gas Engineering and Technology (CS-OGET)	Universidade Eduardo Mondlane	1. Dr Luís Hélder Mendes Lucas 2. Prof. Mussa Achimo 3. Prof. Manuel Bazo 4. Ms. Kátia Marisa Madeira de Morais	RSC member
<b>RWANDA</b>	ESC 61 African Centre of Excellence in Energy for Sustainable Development (ACEESD)	University of Rwanda – College of Science & Technology	1. Prof. Etienne Ntagwirumugara 2. Dr. Kabiri Charles 3. Mr. Mike Hughes (RSC Member)	
	ESC 66 African Centre of Excellence in Internet of Things (ACEIoT)	University of Rwanda – College of Science & Technology	1. Dr. Rutabayiro Ngoga Said 2. Prof. Santhi Kumarana	
	ESC 82 African Center of Excellence for Teaching and Learning Mathematics and Science (ACEITLMS)	University of Rwanda College of Education	1. Prof. Lakhan Lal Yadav 2. Prof. Joachim Nzotungicimpaye	
	ESC 91 African Centre of Excellence for Data Sciences (ACE-DS)	University of Rwanda – College of Business & Economics	1. Patrick McSharry 2. Charles Ruranga 3. Ms Beline MUKARWEGO 4. Mr Leandre NGIRUWONSANGA	
<b>TANZANIA</b>	ESC 27 African Centre of Excellence for Innovative Rodent Pest Management & Biosensor Technology Development (IRPM&BTD)	Sokoine University of Agriculture	1. Dr Ladislaus Laurent Mnyone 2. Prof. Apia W. Massawe 3. Prof. Rhodes Makundi 4. Prof. Sylvia Temu	RSC member
	ESC 38 Southern African Centre for Infectious Disease Surveillance (SACIDS)	Sokoine University of Agriculture	1. Prof. Gerald Misinzo 2. Prof. Mecky Matee 3. Dr. Filomena Namuba 4. Mr. Emmanuel Mkilalu	
			1. Mr. Edgar Kipoki	

	ESC 57 Water Infrastructure & Sustainable Energy Centre for the Futures (WISE FUTURES)	Nelson Mandela African Institution of Science & Technology	2.Dr. Yusuf Abeid Chande Jande 3.Dr. Hans Komakech 4.Ms. Grace Cussack	
	ESC 85 Collaborating Centre for Research, Evidence, Agricultural Advancement & Teaching Excellence & Sustainability (CREATES)	Nelson Mandela African Institution of Science & Technology	1.Ms. Sarah Angelo 2.Prof. Hulda Shaidi Swai 3. Ms. Catherine Kilindi	
<b>UGANDA</b>	ESC 10 Makerere University Regional Centre for Crop Improvement (MaRCCI)	Makerere University	1.Dr. Richard Edema 2.Prof. Paul Gibson 3.Dr. Sarah Akello 4.Tom Obeke 5. Robert Odok Oceng	RSC member
	ESC 72 Centre of Materials, Product Development & Nanotechnology (MAPRONANO)	Makerere University	1. Prof. John Baptist Kirabira 2. Mr. Brian Mujuni 3. Mr. Sabiiti Byamugisha 4. Mr. Bosco Karubanga	
	ESC 25 African Centre for Agro-ecology & Livelihood Systems (ACALISE)	Uganda Martyrs University	1. Prof. John Chrysostom Maviiri 2. Dr. Jude Ssebuwufu 3. Prof. Julius Mwine 4. Dr Joseph Ssemakula	
	ESC 44 Pharm-Biotechnology & Traditional Medicine Centre (PHARMTRAC)	Mbarara University of Science & Technology	1. Prof. Celestino Obua 2. Dr. Casim Umba Tolo 3. Mr. Dominique Musana 4. Dr. Patrick Engeu Ogwang	
<b>ZAMBIA</b>	ESC 39 Centre of Excellence for Emerging and Zoonotic Diseases (ACEEZD)	University of Zambia	1.Professor Aaron S. Mweene 2.Dr. Humphrey Simukoko 3.Dr. Musso Munyeme 4.Dr. Andrew Phiri 5. Mrs. Jane Chinkusu	RSC member
	ESC 79 The Copperbelt University Africa Centre of Excellence for Sustainable Mining	Copperbelt University	1.Dr. Phenny Mwaanga 2.Prof. Jameson Mbale	

**ANNEX D**  
**M&E TRACKING TOOL TEMPLATE**

Indicators			Country									
			Host University									
			Name of Center									
			Short name of Center									
			Baseline	Y1		Y2		Y3		Y4		Y5
Target	Actual	Target		Actual	Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Target	Actual		
PDO	1. Regional students enrolled in ACEs: (i) Masters (No. of Female) (ii) PhD (No. of female)	Masters (Total)										
		Masters (Female)										
		PhD (Total)										
		PhD (Female)										
		Short-term courses (Total)										
	2. Students (national and regional) enrolled in ACEs: (i) Masters (No. of female) (ii) PhD (No. of female)	Masters (Total)										
		Masters (Female)										
		PhD (Total)										
		PhD (Female)										
		Short-term courses (Total)										
	3. MOUs on partnerships for collaboration in applied research and training entered into by the ACEs											
	4. Accredited education programs offered by the ACEs	Total										
		National										
		Regional										
		International										
		Short-term Courses										



	5. Direct Project Beneficiaries (of which female)	Total												
		Female (%)												
<b>Component 1</b>	1. Faculty and PhD students exchanges to promote research and teaching (No. of female)	Total												
		Female												
	2. Amount of externally generated revenue by the ACEs													
	3. Internationally recognized research publications in disciplines supported by the ACE Program and with regional coauthors	Total												
		No. co-authored with regional collaborators												
4. No. of institutions hosting ACEs participating in the PASET benchmarking exercise														
<b>Component 2</b>	1. Events that foster partnerships between ACE and private sector/industry													
<b>Component 3</b>	1. Knowledge sharing events with ACEs, partner institutions, academia and diaspora													
	2. Reports by ACEs on Beneficiary Satisfaction													
	3. Timely verification of ACE achievement of DLIs													
	4. Biannual reporting on M&E of the ACEs													

**ANNEX E**  
**RSC MEETING ACTION POINTS**

**ACE II** Eastern and Southern Africa  
Higher Education Centers of Excellence Project



**ACTION POINTS**

**THE 8<sup>TH</sup> REGIONAL STEERING COMMITTEE (RSC) MEETING**  
**FRIDAY 10<sup>TH</sup> NOVEMBER 2017**  
**ACCRA, GHANA**

**Present were:** Prof Kojo Appiah (Chair), Prof Alexandre Lyambabaje, Dr Xiaoyan Liang, Dr. Manuel Bazo, Mr. Michael Hughes Athony, Mrs. Jane Chinkusu, Dr. Samson MacJessie Mbewe, Mr. Mr. Robert Odok Oceng, Prof. Enos Charles Maponga, Dr Eugene Mutimura (Secretary)

**Absent with Apology:** Prof. Goolam Mohamedbhai, Dr. Karimi Florah, Prof Sylvia Temu, Dr Zerihun Kebede, Prof Prof. Winston Soboyejo

SN	ACTIVITY	ACTION POINTS
1	<b>Independent Verifier firm</b> for verification of ACEs DLIs/DLRs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) The RSC Members approved 5 firms that were shortlisted, and to which RFP were sent on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2017</li> <li>b) Appointed and approved RSC Committee (<i>Prof Manuel Bazo, Mrs Jane Chinkusu, Mr. Robert Odok Oceng, Prof Sylvia Temu</i>) to carry out Technical Evaluation of RFP for Independent verifier firm applications between 11-15<sup>th</sup> December 2017.</li> <li>c) Directed that contract negotiation start earlier than the date of 19<sup>th</sup> Feb 2018 stipulated in the Procurement plan. This will allow the firm to start commencement of consultancy work earlier than planned date of 12<sup>th</sup> March 2018</li> </ul>
2	<b>Technical Support Missions to ACEs</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Directed that within the next 6 months, technical support missions to ACEs be more harmonized through mutual participation of both IUCEA and the World Bank (WB)</li> <li>b) Directed that Technical support missions consider informing and liaising with national stakeholders e.g. WB TTL, National Steering Committee (NSC), VCs and other University leadership about the missions</li> </ul>

3	<b>Capacity building support to ACEs through Regional Interventions (Component 2)</b>	<p>a) Directed that IUCEA implements the activities under Component 2 through i) <i>Capacity development for ACEs partnership with private sector and industry</i> and ii) <i>Competitive Masters Scholarships to academically deserving future talents to promote regional student mobility</i></p> <p>b) Directed that IUCEA in consultation with the WB outsources expertise to: i) support development of eligibility criteria for ACEs to compete through co-financing development of incubation centers or learning factories by 4 disciplines (<i>Industry, Agriculture, Health and Education/Statistics</i>); ii) develop a mechanism for regional internships of MSc students to encourage improved skills acquisition; iii) in consultation with the WB develop an action plan for details of carrying out tracer studies</p> <p>c) In order to ensure higher female enrollment, the RSC members authorized IUCEA to provide all 60 MSc scholarships to female graduate students</p>
4	Report of Interviews of applicants for Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer	<p>a) Received and approved Report on Interviews of M&amp;E Officer and took note of the 4 recommended candidates with &gt;80% score</p> <p>b) Directed that the first applicant with highest score of 85.5%, Mr. Samson Ojesi be invited to start contract negotiations by next week as due diligence process is being carried out by IUCEA</p>
5	Report on the process for hiring Procurement Assistant	<p>a) Received and approved the process of hiring Procurement Assistant</p> <p>b) Directed that shortlisting of applicants takes place as soon as possible, so that interviews of shortlisted candidates takes place during evaluation of technical proposal of Independent verifier Firm</p>
6	Report on the process for hiring an Audit Consultant	<p>a) Received and approved the report on the process of hiring an Audit consultant</p> <p>b) Directed that shortlisting of applicants takes place as soon as possible, so that interviews of shortlisted candidates takes place during evaluation of technical proposal of Independent verifier Firm</p>
7	Report on alignment of ACE II staff with project period	<p>a) Observed that ACE II PA contract was aligned to the project duration period after her contract had expired, and after successful IUCEA performance evaluation</p> <p>b) Observed that ACE II ICO Contract will be aligned with project duration period after her contract expires, and after successful IUCEA performance evaluation.</p> <p>c) Directed that contract negotiation start 6 months prior to contract expiry to deter potential loss of staff member</p>
8	WB to review TORs for RSC members	<p>a) Agreed that the WB will review TORs for RSC members</p> <p>b) The review of RSC TORs will focus and provide clarity on conditions to replace RSC members in cases of no shows/ absenteeism, required quorum to hold meetings etc.</p>

<b>9</b>	Sustainability of ACEs through integration of ACEs into University structure	<p>a) For sustainability purposes, The RSC members agreed to play advocacy roles for NSC, University leadership to allow ACEs to operate with some level of autonomy, but be fully integrated within University academic and administrative structure</p> <p>b) The IUCEA and WB to Continue to work and engage VCs on the best mechanisms for full integration of ACEs into University activities</p>
<b>10</b>	More participation of ACE in Sustainable Food Systems (ACE-SFS), University of Zimbabwe into ACE II activities	<p>a) Noted that although ACE-SFS was invited to benefit from ACE II, it is limited by funding as it is not IDA eligible.</p> <p>b) The RSC suggested that National WB office in Harare liaise with WB Washington DC to assess possibility for ACE-SFS to benefit from ACEs funding</p> <p>c) Dr. Xiaoyan Liang, the WB ACE II TTL will consult WB Lawyers to assess whether ACE-SFS can benefit from IUCEA/RFU Credit funding to attend ACEs Meetings</p> <p>d) Also, Dr Liang will assess whether there is a possibility for ACE-SFS to benefit from other WB Trust funding</p>
<b>11</b>	The Next RSC Meeting venue & date	Agreed that the next RSC Meeting will take place in Lusaka, Zambia in early May 2018.

**Eastern and Southern Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence (ACE II)**

## DEFINITIONS OF DISBURSEMENT LINKED INDICATORS

Version November 12, 2017

### Notes:

- Total disbursement is limited to the overall amount of financing for each ACE, which has been confirmed during negotiations.
- Disbursement amount is the capped disbursement amount per DLR for the project period of five years. Each ACE, with the exception of ACEs in Rwanda, can receive a maximum of up to US\$6 million over the project duration of 5 years. Of the four ACEs in Rwanda, as agreed with the Government of Rwanda, two (Education and Statistics) can receive a maximum of US\$4.5 million and the remaining two (ICT and Energy) can receive a maximum of US\$5.5 million over the project duration.
- DLI amounts will be proportionately allocated based on the total financing for that ACE (18 percent for DLI#1, 72 percent for DLI #2, 5 percent each for DLI #3 and #4)
- During implementation each ACE will have flexibility to achieve education and research excellence through completing different combinations of the education and research results indicated in DLRs #2.2 – 2.7. Therefore, the amounts allocated to each DLR#2.2 – 2.7 can be adjusted downwards and upwards. But, no more than 50 percent of the original amount capped for each DLR#2.2 – 2.7 can be re-allocated. The financing allocated to DLR# 2.1 and DLR# 2.8 is not adjustable and remains fixed. All adjustments to the amount of financing per DLI and DLR, including to DLR#2.2 – 2.7, will have to be requested by the ACE, and approved by the National Steering Committee and the Bank. During the mid-term review, the DLI/DLR allocation amounts and undisbursed funds will be revisited.

### 1. DLI #1: Institutional readiness

**Total amount: US\$ 1,100,000**

#### 1.1. DLR#1.1: Completion of Effectiveness Conditions

**Total Amount: US\$ 600,000**

- Disbursed when all conditions for effectiveness outlined in the legal agreements signed between the ACE hosting government and the World Bank are met

#### 1.2. DLR#1.2: Development of the Project Implementation Plan

**Total Amount: US\$ 500,000**

- Disbursed when detailed implementation plan of ACE is approved by the ministry in charge of higher education as part of the Performance Agreement.

### 2. DLI #2: Excellence in education and research capacity and development impact

**Total amount: US\$ 4,300,000**

#### 2.1. DLR# 2.1: Timely annual implementation of the plans

**Total amount: US\$ 500,000 (100,000 per year)**

**Definitions and conditions:**

- a. If an ACE achieves 50 percent of this DLR in a given year, it will receive 50 percent of the allocation US\$100,000 for this DLR in that year, i.e., US\$50,000.
- b. If an ACE achieves 85 percent of this DLR in a given year, it will receive 85 percent of the allocation US\$100,000 for this DLR in that year, i.e., US\$85,000.
- c. If an ACE achieves beyond 85 percent of this DLR in a given year, it will receive 100 percent of the allocation US\$100,000 for this DLR in that year, i.e., US\$100,000.
- d. Timely implementation is measured against annual work plan and procurement plan

**2.2. DLR #2.2: Newly enrolled students in the ACE of which at least 20% must be regional (African) students.****Total Amount: US\$ 1,200,000****Definitions and conditions:**

- a. ACE enrolment that occurs after 1st August, 2016 is counted towards the DLIs in the first year.
- b. The term “regional” in this results framework always refers to African students who are not from the country hosting the particular ACE. Hence, this indicator measures the number of African students who are not from the country hosting the particular ACE and are enrolled in Masters and/or PhD courses (for at least one semester).
- c. Master and PhD Students will have to have completed at least one semester to be included. With universities with strike for over the semester, the Bank will not consider their students as eligible for the disbursement. In case of protracted strikes or other forms of significant interruptions of classes during the semester, the Bank reserves the right to request further information and/or carry out an evaluation whether the new students have completed a full semester. If a PhD student drops out, he/she must be replaced with a new student before another PhD student can be counted. A university can only count a student once in the student indicators, i.e. a Master student cannot also count as a short term student.
- d. Short term students must participate in a program of at least 40 hours in order to be eligible. Faculty in the ACE is ineligible as short term students.
- e. Data for each of the different levels is to be broken down in the comment/details section when reporting, and reflected in the progress reports. - Target numbers with respect to females might vary depending on the engaged sectors (e.g.: extractive industries vis a vis health).

**Disbursement will vary by the program and student profile, and it will be made in two stages** (a) at enrollment in PhD, completion of a Short-Term course, and successful completion of at least one semester for MSc students, and (b) at attaining academic accomplishment in the form of completion of the program for MSc students, and defense/approval of research proposal by PhD students.

**A. Enrollment in PhD/Completion of Short Term Course/ Completion of 1 MSc semester:**

- a. **Short-Term Courses:** Disbursement occurs when any course leading to qualification (certificate/diploma/degree) counts as a short-term course:
  - 400 per male national student
  - 500 per female national student
  - 800 per male regional student
  - 1,000 per female regional student

- b. **Master's:** Disbursement occurs when Master's students have successfully completed at least one semester:
  - 2,500 per male national student
  - 3,000 per female national student
  - 4,500 per male regional student
  - 5,500 per female regional student
- c. **PhD:** Disbursement occurs when PhD students enroll:
  - 12,000 per male national student
  - 15,000 per female national student
  - 25,000 per male regional student
  - 30,000 per female regional student

**B. Disbursement for academic accomplishment:** This will occur upon the student's successful completion of a Master's program or the approval of a student's PhD research proposal. The amount triggered will be half of the above indicated in each category (calculated as below), totaling for not more than 300,000.

- a. **Master's:** Disbursement occurs when Master's students have successfully completed their program:
  - 1,250 per male national student
  - 1,500 per female national student
  - 2,250 per male regional student
  - 2,750 per female regional student
- b. **PhD:** Disbursement occurs when PhD students enroll:
  - 6,000 per male national student
  - 7,500 per female national student
  - 12,500 per male regional student
  - 15,000 per female regional student

### **2.3. DLR#2.3: Accreditation of quality of education programs.**

**Total Amount: US\$ 600,000**

#### **Definitions and conditions:**

- a. This indicator focuses on measuring the Training Quality of the program.
- b. This indicator measures the quality of Masters and PhD programs and counts the number of programs accredited nationally, regionally and internationally by a body satisfactory to IUCEA and the World Bank.
- c. Each level of accreditation has a distinct disbursement amount associated with it.
- d. Accreditation must be with a specialized accreditation provider recognized by national or international authorities and satisfactory to the World Bank. Accreditation cannot be performed by trade or professional associations or other bodies that are not specialized evaluation and accreditation providers.
- e. Accreditation by universities or entities within universities (e.g. faculty senate, quality unit) will not be considered eligible for disbursement.
- f. Self-assessment must be conducted with an international-standard methodology approved by the World Bank.
- g. Accreditation for degree programs, i.e. Master's and PhD, are eligible for disbursement. Short courses are not eligible. Accreditations of universities are not eligible.
- h. Data on number of accredited programs should be disaggregated by internationally accredited degree programs, regionally, and/or nationally accredited programs, and indicate the specifics (no. per level, details of the accrediting institution, etc.).

**Disbursement occurs when a Master or PhD program is accredited by international or regional or national body (satisfactory to IUCEA and the World Bank):**

- 300,000 per program internationally accredited
- 150,000 per program regionally accredited
- 75,000\* per program nationally accredited
- 75,000\* per program for self-evaluation (satisfactory executed according to internationally recognized standard)

\*Self-evaluation and national accreditation, totaling for not more than 300,000

#### **2.4. DLR#2.4: Partnerships for collaboration in applied research and training collaboration**

**Total Amount: US\$ 200,000**

**Definitions and conditions:**

- a. This indicator measures the number of partnerships for collaboration in sector-relevant applied research and training as measured by signed MoUs and signed proposals that outline at least a two-year partnership work program.
- b. In order to access the disbursement under this DLR, at least one of the total approved and signed MoUs should be with private sector.
- c. Each MoU should be supplemented with signed proposals or letter of agreements that provide details of the work plan, such as partnership activities, budgeted contribution on each side, timeline, and key deliverables.
- d. Partnership should be sought from sector relevant institutions, whether public or private, and academic or industrial.

**Disbursement occurs when MoUs are signed and accompanied by signed proposals that outline at least a two-year collaboration and partnership work-program:**

- 30,000 per MoU with public institutions/civil society
- 40,000 per MoU with private sector/ industry

#### **2.5. DLR#2.5: Peer-reviewed journal papers or peer-reviewed conference papers prepared collaboratively with national, regional or international co-authors**

**Total Amount: US\$ 300,000**

**Definitions and conditions:**

- a. This indicator focuses on measuring the research quantity and quality of the program. It records the number of internationally recognized research publications produced by the ACEs in total and with regional and/or international coauthors.
- b. To be counted as a regionally co-authored paper, at least one author should be from the ACE and at least one other author should be from a non-national African institution (including ACE partners). The presence of additional national or international authors does not influence on eligibility for a regionally co-authored paper.
- c. Papers between authors of the same ACE institution will not be considered as intra-regional collaboration irrespective of nationally.

**Disbursement occurs when a paper is accepted by a peer-review journal or is an accepted peer-reviewed conference paper:**

- 10,000 per paper accepted by a peer-reviewed journal with national author(s)
- 30,000 per paper accepted by a peer-reviewed journal with regional author(s)
- 25,000 per paper accepted by a peer-reviewed journal with international author(s)



- 8,000 per paper accepted by a peer-reviewed conference paper with national author(s)
- 25,000 per accepted peer-reviewed conference paper with regional author(s)
- 20,000 per accepted peer-reviewed conference paper with international author(s)

## **2.6. DLR#2.6: Faculty and PhD student exchanges to promote regional research and teaching collaborations**

**Total Amount: US\$ 500,000**

### **Definitions and conditions:**

- This DLR is awarded to the ACE when it hosts faculty/PhD students from other institutions or when it sends its faculty/PhD students to other institutions locally, in the region or internationally.
- The exchange should last for a “period” of minimum two weeks (for teaching or research collaboration).
- Exchanges of Masters students, or Masters students visiting for short term courses, do not qualify for this indicator.

### **Disbursement occurs per “period” by type of exchange:**

- 5,000 per “period” within the country
- 10,000 per “period” outside the country but within the region
- 8,000 per “period” for international, outside the region

## **2.7. DLR#2.7: External revenue generation**

**Total Amount: US\$ 900,000**

### **Definitions and Conditions:**

- This amount includes externally generated revenue deposited into the ACE’s account (exception may be made during the 1<sup>st</sup> year when ACE revenues have been deposited in a different account if the ACE can prove the linkage with ACE program) from tuition fees, other student fees, joint research, sale of consultancies, fund raising and donations, or other external sources.
- These funds are for investment and operation of the ACE.
- It excludes all government education and research endowments, including research grants. However, sale of consultancy work to the government is accepted as externally generated revenue.
- Interest accruing to the project account will not be considered as “external revenue”.
- In-kind contribution is not counted.

### **Disbursement calculation:**

- US\$1 per externally generated US\$1 from national sources
- US\$2 per externally generated US\$1 from regional and international sources

## **2.8. DLR#2.8: Institution participating in benchmarking exercise**

**Total Amount: US\$ 100,000**

### **Definitions and Conditions:**

- The DLR will be disbursed if the ACE hosting university participate in the Partnership of Applied Sciences, Engineering and Technology (PASET) benchmarking exercise

- b. If universities prefer a different benchmarking tool of comparable standards and comprehensiveness as the PASET tool, they may choose to go with that.

### **3. DLI#3<sup>2</sup>: Timely, transparent and institutionally reviewed Financial Management** **Total amount: US\$ 300,000**

#### **3.1. DLR#3.1: Timely Withdrawal applications supported by interim unaudited financial reports for each ACE**

**Total Amount: US\$ 75,000 (15,000 per year)**

The DLR will be disbursed if the ACE submits timely withdrawal applications supported by interim unaudited financial reports showing how funds have been utilized.

#### **3.2. DLR#3.2<sup>3</sup>: Functioning audit committee under each Eastern and Southern African Higher Education Institutions**

**Total Amount: US\$ 75,000 (15,000 per year)**

The DLR will be disbursed if the university under the university council has a functioning audit committee that will amongst other assignments follow up audit issues related to the ACE.

#### **3.3. DLR#3.3: Functioning internal audit unit for each Eastern and Southern African Higher Education Institution**

**Total Amount: US\$ 75,000 (15,000 per year)**

The DLR will be disbursed if a functional internal audit department conducts audits on the project based on a risk based approach.

#### **3.4. DLR#3.4: Transparency of financial management (audit reports, interim unaudited financial reports, budgets and Annual Work Programs are all web accessible)**

**Total Amount: US\$ 75,000 (15,000 per year)**

The DLR will be disbursed if all FM related reports (audit, IFRs, budgets, work programs) are published on ACE websites to promote transparency and accountability

### **4. DLI#4: Timely and Audited Procurement** **Total Amount: US\$ 300,000**

#### **4.1. DLR# 4.1 Timely procurement audit report for each ACE**

**Total Amount: US\$ 150,000 (30,000 per year)**

The DLR will be disbursed if the ACE submits a timely procurement audit report detailing procurement practices.

#### **4.2. DLR#4.2: Timely and satisfactory procurement progress report for each ACE**

**Total Amount: US\$ 150,000 (30,000 per year)**

---

<sup>2</sup> For ACEs in Rwanda, all audit committees under DLRs # 3.2 and 3.3 are at the university level.

<sup>3</sup> For ACEs in Ethiopia, as the current government regulation does not have the provision of such an audit committee, DLR #3.2 will therefore be adjusted to *seventy percent of all internal and external audit issues addressed by management in each Eastern and Southern African Higher Education Institution.*

The DLR will be disbursed based on the timely and satisfactory progress report (against procurement plan and annual work plan) on the ACE's procurement practices.